

INDEPENDENT CITIZEN POLICE REVIEW BOARD

816 Fifth Avenue, Suite 400 Pittsburgh PA 15219 412-765-8023 Telephone – 412-765-8059 Facsimile <u>cprb@pittsburghpa.gov</u> Final 04/26/2022 Review

'Minutes of the CPRB Special Meeting Held on March 22, 2021 (Mtg. No. 242)

Online Zoom Webinar # 881 7040 7510

Pittsburgh, PA 15219 Neighborhood: Citywide

Video of the meeting: <u>https://cprbpgh.org/172667</u>		
Members Present:	Excused Members: N/A	
Dr. Emma Lucas-Darby, Chair	Ms. Karen McLellan, LEP*	
Dr. Mary Jo Guercio	Mr. Sheldon Williams, LEP*	
Ms. Lakeisha Brown		
Mr. Raymond Robinson	Absent:	
Mr. Elwin Green		
Solicitor: Atty. William F. Ward	Vacancy: None	
Staff Present:		
Ms. Elizabeth C. Pittinger, Exec. Director	Excused staff: All present.	
Ms. Stephanie Hampton, Asst. Exec. Director		
Ms. Michelle Gamble, Lead Investigator	*Law Enforcement Professional	
Ms. Sherri Bridgett, Investigator		
Mr. David Ellwood, Investigator		
Ms. Tiffani Hunt, Investigator		

The entire meeting may be viewed here: <u>Independent CPRB Meeting 03/22/2022</u>

Dr. Emma Lucas-Darby, Chair, called the online Zoom meeting to order at approximately 6:07 p.m. and recognized the presence of a quorum.

Dr. Darby recognized excused members, Ms. McLellan and Mr. Williams, and the presence of a quorum.

Dr. Lucas-Darby called for corrections or additions to the Board meeting minutes conducted on March 22, 2022. No modifications or additions were offered, and hearing no objection, Dr. Lucas-Darby declared the minutes adopted as distributed.

Opening remarks by Chair:

Dr. Lucas- Darby had no opening remarks and moved to the Executive Director's Report.

Executive Director's Report:

Ms. Pittinger reported that 46 complaints were received as of March 2022. Ms. Gamble, Intake/Lead Investigator, broke the complaints down by zone for general information. Zone 2, the downtown area had nine (9) complaints, Zone 5, the east region, had nine (9) complaints, Zone 3 & 4 both had eight (8) complaints

each, Zone 6 had six (6) complaints, and Zone one 1 with two (2) complaints. Over the years that have gone by, CPRB received the fewest complaints from Zone 5 than any other zones. As you look back over when the complaints had risen, you can correlate that to changes in leadership within the zone, which would intuitively suggest that leadership does have a lot to do with the satisfaction of the local community in that zone. Zone 1 has only produced two (2) complaints, but the zone is currently going through a lot of difficulties. Zone 1 is a dangerous place but having only two (2) complaints feels like the police and the community are getting along okay. The numbers are tempting, but they don't mean a whole lot but an interesting look at the zone community relationship.

Ms. Hampton and Ms. Gamble are extracting the annual numbers usually provided to the Board in the spring. The breakdown consists of allegations per the complaint, claims by race and gender, and the total allegations for the zones. The report should be to the Board by next month's meeting (April).

Two reports were emailed to each board member. One (1) being the protest After Action Assessment Review (AAR) that was completed by CPRB and the assistance of the Densus Group, and the other being the Taser Briefing update completed with the assistance of Charles A. Peters Jr. Mr. Peters is the son of Charles A. Peters, the former and late Director of the Allegheny County Mental Health and Mental Retardation MHMR Drug and Alcohol and Homeless Programs and, an inaugural board member for CPRB. Both reports are in draft status for two (2) reasons. First, there are still edits that need to be done, for instance, video links and inviting each board member to provide feedback on what may need to be added, removed, or expanded upon. The report will be added to the April agenda so members can openly discuss the reports and deliberate on whether to adopt the reports or issue them publicly with no adoption attached to them, whatever the preference of the Board, but it would require the Board to deliberate and under the <u>PA Sunshine Act</u> rules we must make sure the deliberation occurs in public.

Ms. Pittinger informed the pre-hearing conference for case 230-19, scheduled for this evening before the regularly scheduled board meeting, has been postponed until further notice. CPRB received communication from the Subject Officer's council requesting the dismissal of the case. The case will come back to the Board for review again in April so that it will be on the agenda, and any consideration or deliberations the Board may wish to engage in will be done in the public venue.

Ms. Brown asked where the Board was with the email received from the mayor's office to each board member requesting an interview because she had not responded to the email? Ms. Pittinger answered she had responded to the communication from the mayor's office asking for an interview and to assess whether the Board's vision and goals for the position would be compatible with the new administration. Board members are appointed to a term only to be removed for cause by the Mayor, and that cause has to be approved by 2/3 of the City Council before a member can be removed for cause only. The 2020 referendum also extended the protection of board members for service on the Board. Ms. Pittinger went on to say she had explained just that in her email reply to the administrative person and had not heard back. Ms. Pittinger also informed the Board she was asked to apply for her position, and she explained she works for the Board and not the Mayor and that all goes to the essence of the independence of the Board. The Board is appointed to conduct business on behalf of the people of the City of Pittsburgh in an independent oversight role and not to promote anyone's agenda, the administration's political agenda, or any policy agenda.

Ms. Pittinger informed Dr. Darby and the Board she wanted to correct something and asked if Mr. Ward (Bill) could direct how to do it properly so the record was correct. Last month, Ms. Pittinger informed the Board

that OMI did not cooperate with the After Action Review (AAR) with Densus, which is incorrect. OMI was not involved in the review and played no role in that assessment, and wanted to make that correction on record.

Mr. Ward replied the minutes had been approved as distributed, but they could be amended and then take a vote. Ms. Brown asked if someone needed to make a motion for the minutes to be amended? Mr. Ward answered before the vote that on the page of the 20220222 minutes for approval 20220322, page numbered 3 of 10 of the entire packet, the issue that's before the Board now is "Dr. Lucas-Darby asked if OMI was cooperating with the Densus Group and where does that stand? Ms. Pittinger responded that OMI is not cooperating with Densus, and the Bureau of Police did not cooperate." Will the amendment be limited to OMI or also to the PBP? Ms. Pittinger answered the amendment was to OMI. The PBP did not cooperate. Mr. Ward recommended the substitution be that OMI has been cooperating or was cooperating, whichever is more appropriate. Ms. Pittinger answered OMI was not included in the assessment. They were never approached to participate in the assessment.

Mr. Ward asked if the words on the issue's minutes should read, "Ms. Pittinger responded that OMI was not involved in the Densus After Action Assessment." Ms. Pittinger said that would be fine.

Dr. Darby called for a motion to amend the 20220222 minutes' at the bottom of page 3 Of 10: Dr. Lucas-Darby asked if OMI was cooperating with the Densus Group, and where does that stand? Ms. Pittinger responded that OMI was not involved in the After Action Assessment review conducted by Densus, and the Pittsburgh Bureau of Police did not cooperate; the motion was offered by Mr. Green and seconded by Dr. Guercio, and the motion was adopted unanimously.

Dr. Darby informed everyone the correct procedure would be to correct the minutes from last month (February's meeting), and the minutes from this month (March's meeting) will indicate the change was made.

Ms. Hampton asked if she was to correct the minutes being referenced now or add the motion to the minutes today? Dr. Darby answered that her understanding, according to the Robert Rules of Order, when you make a change in the minutes, you go back and correct the minutes that should be updated, but it's noted in the current minutes that the correction was made.

Dr. Darby asked about the AAR. When the Board talks about "release the reports," we make them public but do we release them to specific entities? Ms. Pittinger answered yes.

Unfinished Business

No unfinished business was presented.

New Business:

No new business was introduced.

Case Review:

Dr. Darby moved to the Case Review Agenda (copy attached). Each group of recommendations was voted upon as recorded on the attached Case Review Actions. Case Review Action 03/22/2022 As mentioned earlier, the pre-hearing conference has been postponed, and the Board will hear more about that case in the April meeting.

Mr. Green asked if in case of 001-22 paragraph 15: "W#1 was not informed about the hearing or the "socalled" discipline he received." Is that the correct protocol when the officer is the complainant against another officer to not be aware of discipline received in the Discipline Hearing involving the Subject Officer? Ms. Pittinger asked who the investigator is on the case and Mr. Green answered Bridgett. Ms. Bridgett replied that she was not sure why Witness 1 wasn't notified of the hearing and that Ms. Bridgett emailed her but believes she is still on military leave. Ms. Pittinger informed that related to that case, there was a report today that a petition to convert the Temporary Restraining Order to a Permanent Restraining Order.

Next Meeting:

Dr. Darby announced the time and location of the next Board meeting: Tuesday, April 26, 2022, at 6:00 p.m. via Zoom. The meeting link will be posted on the cprbpgh.org website and Facebook page.

Public Comment:

Hi and Bye from Mark and Tris Ozark.

Ms. Pittinger reminded that the Board was to reconsider the monthly board meeting remaining on zoom whether or not to continue on zoom for the next quarter. Dr. Darby asked that we take that consideration month to month? Ms. Pittinger answered that would be fine.

<u>Dr. Darby called for a motion to adjourn, and the motion was offered by Dr. Guercio and seconded by Mr.</u> <u>Green, and the motion was adopted unanimously.</u>

The entire meeting may be viewed here: Independent CPRB Regular Meeting 03/22/2022

Respectfully Submitted,

Stephonie M. Darman

Stephanie M. Dorman Assistant Executive Director

Attachments (1): 03/22/2022 Case Review Actions

CPRB CASE REVIEW AGENDA 03/22/2022

PRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	Allegation(s)	Summary	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE
	PENDING DISTRIBUTION	PRIOR TO MEETING 192-20 Re	EQUEST PUBLIC HEARING (1	L)
192-20 Ellwood	11-3, 4.1.1 4.1.2 Unbiased Policing 12-6, (3.1) Use of Force 12-9 3.0 Continuum Of Control	Cx alleges the SOs racially profiled her son, the Victim. Cx states that during a traffic stop, the SOs punched the Victim in the face and pointed a gun at his head while using profanity towards him.	Authorize a public hearing (Pending distribution before the meeting.)	The evidence establishes facts that support the allegations.
			1	FULL INVESTIGATION (2)
001-22-ED Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member or employee 20-01 (6.4.1, 6.4.5, 6.4.6) No Harassment	On December 30, 2021, CPRB received an email from W#1 detailing her sexual assault by a fellow PBP Officer (SO).	Authorize full investigation	Preliminary evidence provides cause to advance the investigation.
018-22-ED Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7.1)(3.7.2) Conduct Towards the Public 16-1 (3.19.1) Truthfulness 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty	The Cx alleges that on 12/21/2021, the SO neglected to investigate false charges that were filed against her by W#1, W#2, and W#3.	Authorize full investigation	Preliminary evidence provides cause to advance the investigation.
		30	DAY EXTENSION OF FU	LL INVESTIGATION (0)
				UNSUSTAINABLE (0)
				UNFOUNDED (0)
				OTHER (0)
				SUSPENSION (2)
221-21 Hunt	12-06.3.2 Use of Force 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7.1) (3.7.2) Conduct Towards the Public 44-1 Arrests	The Cx alleges the SOs used excessive force against his Grandson and Daughter (V#1 & V#2) for unknown reasons while they were leaving a bar called Tequila Cowboy.	Authorize suspension until April 2022	More time to determine if the SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
177-21 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty 45-2 Warrantless Searches & Seizures 54-01 Traffic Citations	Cx alleges that SO's illegally stopped him for a traffic violation, towed his vehicle, and searched it without cause.	Authorize suspension until April 2022	More time is needed to obtain officer statements from OMI and identify witnesses.

Continued Suspensions (24 Summaries Provided Upon Request of Member			
CPRB CASE NO. Investigator	Allegation(s)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	Possible Closing Date
165-21 Ellwood	36-01 Evidence Procedure 36-02 Property Room Procedure 40-12.8 Police Response to Domestic Violence	More time is needed to determine who the SOs are because the CAD is not clear which officers acted in what capacity and manner.	TBD
162-21 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty 16-1 (3.19.1) Truthfulness	More time and information are needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
160-21ED Ellwood	11-3 (3.1, 3.2, 4.1.2) Unbiased Policing 12-6 (3.0, 4.0, 5.0) Use of Force 12-8 (3.0, 4.0) Matrix of Control 12-13 Taser 16-1 (3.06) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.07) Conduct Towards the Public	More time is needed to view the ER video footage to view the conduct of the officer.	TBD
148-21 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6.) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 12-6 (5.0) Use of Force	More time is needed to review SO statements that were received on $2/7/22$.	TBD
138-21 Ellwood	12-06.3.2 Use of Force 16-01.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.07 Conduct Toward the Public	More time is needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
121-21 Ellwood	11-3 Unbiased Policing 16-01.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.19 Truthfulness	More time is needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
107-21 Ellwood	16-1.3.06.03: Conduct Unbecoming16-1.3.13: Neglect of Duty 16-1-3.19 Truthfulness 44-13: Arrests	More time is needed to gather documentation to corroborate the conflicting statement of the Cx and SOs.	TBD
104-21 Ellwood	16-01 (3.7.1) Conduct Toward the Public 16-1 (3.06) Conduct Unbecoming 54-01 Traffic Citations	More time and information are needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
099-21 Ellwood	12-06.3.2 Use of Force 16-01.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.07 Conduct Toward the Public 16-01.3.13 Neglect of Duty	More time is needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD

	16-01.3.19 Truthfulness		
CPRB CASE NO. Investigator	Allegation(s)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	POSSIBLE CLOSING DATE
063-21 Ellwood	45-2, (6.0) Investigative Stops and Warrantless Searches of Motor Vehicles 11-3, (1.1.1) Unbiased Policing 16-1, (3.06) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.07) Conduct Towards The Public	More time and information are needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
031-21 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty	The investigator is waiting to speak with SOs	TBD
019-21 Ellwood	37-01 Lost-Stolen- Abandoned-Property 36- 01,(6.0) Evidence Procedures	Waiting for withdrawal	TBD
252-20 Ellwood	16-01 (3.7.1) Conduct Toward the 40-04 Public Motor Vehicle Stops	Waiting for SO statements.	TBD
192-20 Ellwood	11-3, (4.1.1, 4.1.2) Unbiased Policing 12-6, (3.1) Use of Force 12-8, (3.0) Continuum of Control	Waiting for SO statements.	TBD
130-20 Bridgett	16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 36-2 Property Room Procedures	Waiting on SO statement/Under action review by DENSUS	TBD
122-20 Bridgett	16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 12-6 Use of Force	Waiting on after-action assessment	TBD
CPRB CASE NO. Investigator	Allegation(s)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	Possible Closing Date
112-20 Bridgett	11-3 Unbiased Policing 16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16- 1, (3.07) Conduct Toward the Public	Waiting for the Daily Activity Log/ Running Sheet	TBD
041-20 Ellwood	44-1(4.0) Arrests – Physical, Summons, or Warrant 12-06 (3.0) Use of Force	Waiting on BWC from the attorney	TBD
230-19 Ellwood	45-2, (10.0) Warrantless Searches and Seizures	Waiting for transcripts of BWC from OMI	TBD

	12-06 Use of Force 40-04 (03.2, 03.4) Motor Vehicle Stops		
217-19 Ellwood	16-01 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 44-1 Arrest 45-2 Unlawful Search and Seizure	Waiting on Abel's arbitration.	TBD
190-19 Bridgett	16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 40-12 Police-Response-to- Domestic-Violence- Incidents	The case was sustained at OMI for conduct unbecoming. The investigator is trying to determine what disciplinary action the SO received.	TBD
029-19 Bridgett	16-1, (3.1) Obedience to orders/ laws 16-1, (3.6) Conduct unbecoming a member 16-1 (3.9) Insubordination, 62-1, (2.10) Truthfulness False report	The SO is off on worker's comp and may not return to full duty	TBD
016-19 Bridgett	16-1, (3.6) Conduct unbecoming a member 16-1, (3.13 Neglect of duty	W#1 has not been apprehended as of 03/08/2022. The DAs office will prosecute when W#1 is arrested.	TBD
87-18-ED Gamble	12-6 Use of Force 12-7 Discharge of firearms 16-1 (3.6) Conduct unbecoming a member 16-1, (3.19) Truthfulness 62-1 Records/Reports/Files	Waiting for witnesses to cooperate.	TBD

`