

INDEPENDENT CITIZEN POLICE REVIEW BOARD

816 Fifth Avenue, Suite 400
Pittsburgh PA 15219
412-765-8023 Telephone – 412-765-8059 Facsimile
cprb@pittsburghpa.gov

Final for 12/06/2022 Review

`Minutes of the CPRB Meeting Held on October 25, 2022 (Mtg. No. 248)

Online Zoom Webinar # 873 0105 6073 Pittsburgh, PA 15219 Neighborhood: Citywide

Video of the meeting: https://cprbpgh.org/344983

Members Present: **Excused Members:** Dr. Emma Lucas-Darby, Chair Ms. Karen McLellan, LEP* Mr. Elwin Green Mr. Sheldon Williams, LEP* Dr. Mary Jo Guercio Ms. Karen McLellan, LEP* Absent: None Ms. Lakeisha Brown Mr. Raymond Robinson Vacancy: None Solicitor: Atty. William F. Ward *Law Enforcement Professional Staff Present: Excused staff: All present. Ms. Elizabeth C. Pittinger, Exec. Director Ms. Stephanie Hampton, Asst. Exec. Director Ms. Michelle Gamble, Lead Investigator Ms. Sherri Bridgett, Investigator Mr. David Ellwood, Investigator Ms. Tiffani Hunt, Investigator

The entire meeting may be viewed here: Independent CPRB Meeting 10/25/2022

Following correction of technical issues, Dr. Lucas-Darby, Chair, called the online Zoom meeting to order at approximately 6:11 p.m. and acknowledged the presence of a quorum. Mr. Williams and Ms. McClellan were excused.

Dr. Lucas-Darby called for corrections or additions to the Board meeting minutes of September 27, 2022. No modifications or additions were offered, and hearing no objection, Dr. Darby declared the minutes adopted as distributed.

Dr. Lucas-Darby deferred the Chair's comments to follow the Executive Director's report.

Executive Director's Report:

Ms. Pittinger reported that intake received year to date is 183 complaints; she characterized the nature of the complaints as less egregious and fewer than received in previous years.

Ms. Pittinger reminded the Board they had decided to conduct a public hearing for complainants and individuals aware of rude and discourteous conduct by Pittsburgh police officers. Such behavior falls under CPRB Minutes 10/25/2022

Unbecoming Conduct and Conduct Toward the Public. The Board discussed options available for conducting the hearing and decided to incorporate the hearing into its regularly scheduled public meeting on Tuesday, December 6, 2022, at 6:00 p.m.

Ms. Pittinger informed the Board that the City's administration announced its intention to drop the 60-college credit or equivalent pre-requisite qualification for individuals applying to be Pittsburgh police officers. Lowering the standard for police applicants is contrary to the Board's long-standing position. An invitation was extended to Mayor Gainey to come to tonight's meeting to discuss with the Board rationale behind the decision and the potential implications for recruitment, training, and retention of police officers. The invitation was declined due to a conflict with a community meeting on the Mayor's schedule.

Ms. Pittinger informed the Board that interviews for the open Investigator position are underway.

Ms. Hampton, Ms. Bridgett, and Ms. Hunt attended the opening of the new Calvin Hall Community Center in Northview Heights. Calvin Hall, who died under violent circumstances, was a PBP officer whose beat included Northview Heights. Police are endeavoring to re-establish a positive relationship with the community since the Housing Authority Police were disbanded and officers were absorbed into the PBP. Ms. Hampton confirmed they would host a community event on Saturday, October 29th, from 2 pm – 6 pm.

Media reports that eight of the nine members of the Allegheny County independent review board have been appointed. CPRB staff had many discussions with County Council members about the development of their Board and offered to assist with administrative and investigative support.

Mayor Gainey has been soliciting Community perspectives on the desired qualities for the next chief of police. The City Administration has launched a nationwide search for Chief of Police candidates. The community inclusion in that discussion with the Mayor began Monday night at a community meeting held at Carrick High School. CPRB will stay a bit aloof from the process proper so as not to put the Board's future position at risk of being perceived as having any bias associated with the Chief of Police and his or her management of the Bureau.

The entire meeting may be viewed here: Independent CPRB Regular Meeting 10/25/2022

WPXI, Channel 11, reported on the status of drones acquired by the City's Department of Public Safety for police, EMS, search, and rescue operations. Prior to the COVID interruption, the City invested approximately \$65,000 to acquire two drones and certification of personnel to operate the drones. The City's drones have not been deployed. According to the Director of Public Safety, Lee Schmidt, the Department is developing a "use policy" for drones and until a use policy is in place, those City drones will remain grounded. However, in the past, there have been confirmed reports that when an appropriate occasion arises for the use of a drone by police or search & rescue, the City has borrowed drones and used them for the situation. Pittinger recognized the irony that if you are not going to deploy your drones because you don't have a use policy and you are concerned about privacy and the purposes for which a drone may be used, then it does not make sense that you turn around and allow City personnel to use a borrowed drone for purposes that are not established as permissible under City policy. Staff will keep the Board informed as the policy, or use, develop.

Mr. Robinson and Ms. Brown are attending the Fall 2022 Citizen Police Academy (CPA)The CPA opened on October 5, 2022. Ms. Pittinger joined Ms. Erin Bruni, the Director of the Office of Municipal Investigations (OMI) to discuss police accountability with Academy members. Mr. Robinson said it has been more than he

expected, and the class was much more diverse than he thought not just in demographics but also in motivation for coming out to the class. Ms. Brown said she thought it was eye-opening and she was impressed with the reaction from the participants and how engaged they were with the information. She saw a lot of transparency from the officers that spoke. SWAT will be at CPA's next class. Ms. Pittinger said that class would show how specialized the unit is and where you will get the opportunity to assess for yourself the level of professionalism that the specialized units possess. Mr. Robinson was surprised at how many people who are part of the CPA are not City residents.

Mr. Robinson asked about the training or professional development requirements for patrol officers annually. Ms. Pittinger replied that the Municipal Police Officers Education and Training Commission (MPOETC) establishes on an annual basis the available topics and the mandatories. Firearm qualification is a mandatory annual qualification. They must have 16 hours of annual in-service which will include a combination of mandatory and elective topics and legal updates so that they are informed of court decisions having precedential value to their law enforcement practice, i.e., traffic stops.

Mr. Robinson asked regarding the educational requirements, how the administration concluded the educational requirement should be eliminated and what the next steps would be for the change in requirements to become policy. Ms. Pittinger said she believed the Civil Service Commission has the final say over qualifications and she did not know what led to that decision other than recruitment difficulties. Dr. Darby said she thinks it is an issue that will garner a lot of discussion because of the expectations around qualifications and the officers' understanding of human behavior and reacting to it in several situations.

The entire meeting may be viewed here: <u>Independent CPRB Regular Meeting 10/25/2022</u>

Chair's Remarks:

Dr. Lucas-Darby informed the board that she needs to step back from her responsibilities as Chair due to additional family responsibilities. Therefore, she would like to stay on the Board but not continue as Chair. Dr. Lucas-Darby appointed Dr. Guercio to be Acting Chair until an election can be held. Ms. Pittinger said that the Board's rules and operating procedures only indicate that the Board will hold an election to elect a Chair and a Vice Chair and there are no other requirements attached to that process. The Board's custom has been to take voice nominations and voice votes and on one occasion, a secret ballot was conducted. Dr. Lucas-Darby asked the Board what month they would like to hold the election. January was agreed to, and Dr. Darby informed the Board that if anyone is interested in the position to contact Ms. Pittinger. The nominees will be announced at the December meeting and the election in January. Mr. Green asked if the election is held in January would that person's chairmanship be effective immediately. Dr. Lucas-Darby said yes because the vote would take place at the beginning of the meeting.

Unfinished Business:

None

New Business:

The CPRB meeting calendar for 2023. The meetings are noted as being in Council Chambers as a physical location while also available on Zoom. Dr. Lucas-Darby asked if, for the beginning of the year, a preference for an in-person or zoom meeting. Mr. Green prefers Zoom for the convenience advantage to traveling

downtown or to some other location. Dr. Guercio said there have been fewer issues making a quorum on Zoom. Ms. Brown noted that health-wise, staying on Zoom keeps people safe from flu, COVID and variants. The Board will revisit in-person meetings on a quarterly basis.

Case Review:

Dr. Darby moved to the Case Review Agenda (copy attached). Each group of recommendations was voted upon as recorded on the attached Case Review Actions.

The entire meeting may be viewed here: Independent CPRB Regular Meeting 10/25/2022

Next Meeting:

Dr. Lucas-Darby announced the time and location of the next Board meeting: Tuesday, December 06, 2022, at 6:00 p.m. via Zoom. The public hearing on rude & discourteous conduct will precede the regular business meeting. The meeting link will be posted on the cprbpgh.org website and Facebook page.

Public Comment:

The Ozarks sent CPRB good wishes.

With nothing further on the agenda and no objection, Dr. Lucas-Darby declared the meeting adjourned.

The entire meeting may be viewed here: Independent CPRB Meeting 09/27/2022

Respectfully Submitted,

Stephanie M. Dorman

Assistant Executive Director

Attachments (1): 10/25/2022 Case Review Actions

Stephonie M. Darman

Action Date: 10/25/2022 (10) Cases)

$CPRB\ Case\ Review\ Agenda\ 10/25/2022$

CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	Allegation(s)	Summary	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE			
				PUBLIC HEARING ()			
	FULL INVESTIGATION (3)						
171-22 Hunt	11-3 Unbiased Policing 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward The Public 16-1 (3.19.1) Truthfulness 12-6 Use of Force	Cx alleges that the SOs lied about their reason for entering his apartment and then forcefully put him into handcuffs, causing more injury to a preexisting condition.	Authorized Full Investigation 5-0	Prelim Inq. supports the cause to investigate if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures during the Cx's arrest.			
170-22 Ellwood	11.3 Unbiased Policing 12.3 Oath of Office 16.3.01 Obedience to orders and laws 16-1.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-1.3.13 Neglect of Duty	Cxs allege that SO#1 got behind the wheel of his vehicle intoxicated and hit Cx#1's parked vehicle while trying to pull out of a parking space.	Authorized Full Investigation 5-0	Prelim Inq. supports cause to investigate if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.			
157-22 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public	The Cx alleges that she was wrongfully arrested for child endangerment and the SOs wouldn't listen to her side of the story.	Authorized Full Investigation 5-0	Prelim Inq. supports cause to investigate if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures during the arrest.			
		30-DA	Y EXTENSION OF FULI	L INVESTIGATION (5)			
143-22 Ellwood	16-1.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-1.3.07 Conduct Toward the Public	The Cx alleges that the SO was rude and unprofessional toward her during her encounter and arrest.	Authorized 30-day investigation 5-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.			
134-22 Hunt	11-3 Unbiased Policing 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward The Public 16-1 (3.19.1) Truthfulness	The Cx alleges that he was pulled over by the SO and was lied to about the reason for the stop.	Authorized 30-day investigation 5-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures during various traffic stops.			
123-22 Elwood	Unbecoming 41-04.01 Towing Procedures, Reasons for Towing 54-01 Traffic Citations 44-02 Arrests, Summary Citations, Nontraffic 44-03 Arrests, Electronic Citations, Traffic and Nontraffic 40-04 Motor Vehicle Stops	The Cx alleges that the SO pulled V#1 over and asked to search the vehicle he was driving but the SO and other officers present would not explain their probable cause	Authorized 30-day investigation 5-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.			

CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	SUMMARY	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE			
100-22 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public	The Cx alleges that she was charged with trespassing on her property.	Authorized 30-day investigation 5-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedure.			
020-22 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member or Employee 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty 16-1 (3.19.1) Truthfulness	The Cx, the victim of a home invasion, alleges that SO#1 was rude and discourteous towards her when she questioned why W#1 did not appear in court that day.	Authorized 30-day investigation 5-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures or if they were rude and discourteous.			
	,			Unsustainable (0)			
				Unfounded (0)			
				OTHER (1)			
029-19 Bridgett	16-1, (3.1) Obedience to orders/laws 16-1, (3.6) Conduct unbecoming a member 16-1 (3.9) Insubordination, 62-1, (2.10) Truthfulness False report	The Cx alleges the SO perjured himself during his trial on 09/12/3018.	Authorized as out of jurisdiction 5-0	Although the SO is currently off on worker's comp, he is not returning to his position within the PBP.			
	Suspension (o)						
063-22 Bridgett	1. 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member	Cx alleges an improper traffic stop related to tint and progression to improper vehicle search	Update provided. Remain suspended.	Awaiting receipt of evidence & outcome of the prelim			

******* Continuing Suspensions Follow *********

CONTINUED SUSPENSIONS (11 SUMMARIES PROVIDED UPON REQUEST OF MEMBER				
CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	Allegation(s)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	Possible Closing Date	
063-22 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 40-4 Traffic Stops	More time is needed to review BWC footage	TBD (Updated 10/25/22)	
035-22 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming A Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward The Public 16-1 (3.9) Truthfulness 44-1 Arrests 45-2 (5.1) Warrantless Searches & Seizures	More time is needed to obtain BWC footage, SO statements, Affidavit of Probable Cause, receipts for vehicle repairs, and identify witnesses.	TBD	
001-22 ED Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 20-01 (6.4.1, 6.4.5, 6.4.6) No Harassment	More time is needed for the investigation.	TBD	
177-21 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty 45-2 Warrantless Searches & Seizures 54-01 Traffic Citation	More time is needed to obtain BWC footage, SO statements, affidavit of probable cause, receipts for vehicle repairs, and identify the witnesses.	TBD	
160-21ED Ellwood	11-3 (3.1, 3.2,.1.2) Unbiased Policing 12-6 (3.0, 4.0, 5.0) Use of Force 12-8 (3.0, 4.0) Matrix of Control 12-13 Taser 16-1 (3.06) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.07) Conduct Towards the Public	More time is needed to view the ER video footage to view the officer's conduct.	TBD	
148-21 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6.) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 12-6 (5.0) Use of Force	There was no contact information for the combatants in the investigative report. The investigator is trying to verify if all of the proper paperwork was completed.	TBD	
138-21 Ellwood	12-06.3.2 Use of Force 16-01.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.07 Conduct Toward the Public	More time is needed to determine if the SO violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD	
252-20 Ellwood	16-01 (3.7.1) Conduct Toward the 40-04 Public Motor Vehicle Stops	Waiting for SO statements.	TBD	

CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	Allegation(s)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	POSSIBLE CLOSING DATE
112-20 Bridgett	11-3 Unbiased Policing 16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.07) Conduct Toward the Public	Waiting for the Daily Activity Log/ Running Sheet from the PBP	TBD
190-19 Bridgett	16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 40-12 Police-Response-to- Domestic-Violence- Incidents	The investigator is trying to determine what disciplinary action the SO received.	TBD
87-18-ED Gamble	12-6 Use of Force 12-7 Discharge of firearms 16-1 (3.6) Conduct unbecoming a member 16-1, (3.19) Truthfulness 62-1 Records/Reports/Files	Waiting for witnesses to cooperate.	TBD