



INDEPENDENT CITIZEN POLICE REVIEW BOARD

816 Fifth Avenue, Suite 400
Pittsburgh PA 15219
412-765-8023 Telephone – 412-765-8059 Facsimile
cprb@pittsburghpa.gov

Final for
4/23/24
Review

NOTES of the CPRB Meeting Held on March 26, 2024 (Mtg. No. 262)

Online Zoom Webinar # 854 0367 9472

Pittsburgh, PA 15219
Neighborhood: Citywide

Video of the meeting: <https://cprbpg.org/668514>

<p>Members Present:</p> <p>Dr. Mary Jo Guercio, Chair Mr. Daylon Davis Mr. Gregory Kottler Mr. Raymond Robinson Ms. Terri Shields</p> <p>Solicitor: Atty. William F. Ward *Law Enforcement Professional</p> <p>Staff Present: Ms. Elizabeth C. Pittinger, Exec. Director Ms. Stephanie Hampton, Asst. Exec. Director Ms. Michelle Kirchner, Lead Investigator Ms. Sherri Bridgett, Community Liaison Ms. Da'Mesha Carpenter, Admin. Assistant MS. Nicole Edwards, Investigator Mr. David Ellwood, Investigator Ms. Tiffani Hunt, Investigator</p>	<p>Excused Members:</p> <p>Mr. Sheldon Williams, LEP*</p> <p>Vacancy: Seat #2 – LEP – Council Designate</p> <p>Excused staff: All present.</p>
---	--

The entire meeting may be viewed here: [Independent CPRB Meeting 3/26/24](#)

Dr. Mary Jo Guercio, Chair, called the online Zoom meeting to order at approximately 6:01 p.m. Dr. Guercio acknowledged the presence of a quorum.

Opening remarks by the Chair:

Dr. Guercio informed the Board that the Executive Session discussed at the previous meeting had taken place, and meeting minutes had been taken for that session.

A motion to approve the 02/27/2024 Board meeting minutes was offered by Mr. Daylon Davis, seconded by Ms. Terri Shields, and approved unanimously.

Executive Director's Report:

Ms. Elizabeth Pittinger, Executive Director, reported the current intake status of 44 complaints received in 2024.

Ms. Pittinger informed the Board that a request was made to the Pittsburgh Bureau of Police (PBP) to provide a copy of the rationale behind the Bureau's re-organization and newly implemented practices. She acknowledged the Bureau's cooperation and prompt provision of the data underlying the rationale for the re-organization. Ms. Pittinger noted that any meaningful evaluation of the efficiency and effectiveness will take time.

Mr. Davis asked if data would be tracked on the changes and if a report would be generated to see how these changes impact the officers and the community. Ms. Pittinger agreed that data tracking and report generation are essential for understanding the progress and impact of the changes. She emphasized that more time would be needed to ensure the accuracy and credibility of future reports.

Ms. Robinson stated that Chief Larry Sciotto spoke at the Brighton Heights Community Meeting, where he addressed many questions regarding why the PBP reorganization is happening. Chief Sciotto discussed officer wellness, the nature of the calls, and the Telephone Reporting Unit (TRU).

Mr. Kottler asked who conducted the study for the data and what other cities have used this data for.

Ms. Pittinger referred to the Matrix Report, released in July 2023, which generated local controversy. She clarified that while there have been claims that the PBP is not using the Matrix Report's recommendations, it seems like many of the recommendations align with adjustments made in the PBP.

Mr. Kottler also asked if this report was brought to the City or if the City contacted this organization regarding the report and what other cities have used this data.

Ms. Pittinger stated that she was under the impression that the City reached out to Matrix, not solicited by the organization, and the City paid approximately \$20,000 for this report. She also noted that some other cities may have used the Matrix Group to assess police services, but she did not know which cities.

Dr. Guercio asked if there was a dollar amount where the City is required to put something out for Bid? Ms. Stephanie Hampton, Assistant Executive Director, advised the dollar amount is \$25,000.

Ms. Pittinger reminded the Board of the time when CPRB attempted to secure the services of The Densus Group for an extensive review of the police response to local protests and demonstrations following the death of George Floyd. The cost of that after-action review and report was \$25,000. The City's Office of Management and Budget (OMB) informed the Board that the project must be put out for bid with a Request for Proposal (RFP) from interested parties.

Mr. Davis raised concerns regarding the CPRB website. After discussion and review with staff, Ms. Pittinger stated that two issues were identified: chronology of material and redundancies throughout the website. She emphasized the importance of the Board's feedback, stating that CPRB Staff will work on a survey for Board members to identify priorities and suggestions for the website.

The entire meeting may be viewed here: [Independent CPRB Meeting 3/26/2024](#)

Case Review:

Dr. Guercio moved to the Case Review Agenda (copy attached). Each group of recommendations was voted upon as recorded on the attached Case Review Actions.

Ms. Shields asked for clarification for case #017-24. Ms. Pittinger explained that these cases would not be closed but would move on to a full investigation.

Mr. Davis had a question regarding case #043-23. He wanted to know if the officer involved in that incident was working as an acting officer or if the establishment had hired the officer and whether the Board had jurisdiction. Ms. Pittinger explained that any Pittsburgh police officer acting under the “color of law”, whether in uniform or not, is subject to the Board’s jurisdiction. She clarified that Officers can no longer work privately as Pittsburgh Police Officers for private parties or establishment proprietors. She stated that there are policies around eligibility, assignments, and accountability for secondary details.

Unfinished Business:

None

New Business:

Mr. Davis would like a more in-depth explanation of the investigative process and where the time frames referred to in summaries come from. Dr. Guercio reminded Members that the documents previously distributed to them may be helpful with process questions. Ms. Pittinger replied that a session would be scheduled to explain the process to new Board members.

Public Comment:

Mr. and Mr. Ozark extended greetings to the Board.

A motion to adjourn the meeting was offered by Mr. Robinson, seconded by Mr. Kottler, and approved unanimously.

Dr. Guercio adjourned the meeting at approximately 6:52 p.m.

The entire meeting may be viewed here: [Independent CPRB Meeting 3/26/2024](#)

Respectfully Submitted,

Stephanie M. Dorman

Action Date: 03/26/2024
(14 Cases)

CPRB CASE REVIEW AGENDA 03/26/2024

<i>CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR</i>	<i>ALLEGATION(S)</i>	<i>SUMMARY</i>	<i>RECOMMENDATION</i>	<i>RATIONALE</i>
				<i>PUBLIC HEARING (0)</i>
				<i>FULL INVESTIGATION (6)</i>
028-24 Edwards	16-1, (3.06) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.07) Conduct Toward the Public	The Cx alleged that the SOs used excessive force on her after she knocked on the wrong residence door early in the morning.	Authorized Full Investigation 4-0	Preliminary Inquiry (PI) supports the cause of investigating if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
027-24 Hunt	11.3, (3.0) Un-biased Policing 12-6 Use of Force 16-1, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1, (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 43-10, (10.3) Juvenile Policies and Procedures	An Executive Director inquiry (EDI) has been opened based on a WPXI News release that shows excessive force used on a handcuffed Juvenile who was shoved against a wall by the SO while in custody.	Authorized Full Investigation 4-0	Preliminary Inquiry (PI) supports the cause of investigating if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
025-24 Ellwood	12-3, (2.0) Oath of Office 16-01, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming 16-0, (3.13) Neglect of Duty 44-01, (4.0) Physical Arrests	The Cx alleges that the SO failed to arrest W#1 after he violated a no-contact order and had an outstanding warrant for failure to appear in court.	Authorized Full Investigation 4-0	Preliminary Inquiry (PI) supports the cause of investigating if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.

017-24 Edwards	16-01, (3.6.3) Standards of Conduct – Conduct Unbecoming A Member or Employee 16-01, (3.7) Conduct Towards the Public	The Executive Director has opened an inquiry into an incident on the West End Bridge on January 27, 2024. The EDI will investigate PBP policies and procedures after the Victim was struck by a vehicle and killed on the West End Bridge following her interactions with SOs.	Authorized Full Investigation 4-0	Preliminary Inquiry (PI) supports the cause of investigating if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
016-24 Ellwood	11-3.4.1.3 Unbiased Policing 16-01.3.6 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.7 Conduct Toward the Public 40-4.3.2 Stopping Traffic Violators	The Cx alleges that the SO racially profiled him when he saw him in a luxury vehicle and then targeted him while he was a passenger in W#3's vehicle.	Authorized Full Investigation 4-0	Preliminary Inquiry (PI) supports the cause of investigating if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
CPRB CASE No. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	SUMMARY	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE
014-24 Ellwood	12-06 Use of Force 12-07 Discharge of Firearms and Less Lethal Weapons 12-08 Matrix of Control	The Executive Director has opened an inquiry into the shooting of a male Victim on the 1900 block of Huron St. in the Southside Slopes neighborhood of Pittsburgh.	Authorized Full Investigation 4-0	Preliminary Inquiry (PI) supports the cause of investigating if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
30-DAY EXTENSION OF FULL INVESTIGATION (1)				
012-24 Edwards	16-01, (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-01, (3.13) Neglect of Duty 40-19 (5.0) Reports	The Complainant (Cx) alleges that the Subject Officers (SOs) neglected their duty to file a report on her behalf after she had an altercation with W#1, and he injured her foot.	Authorized 30-day Investigation. 4-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.
UNFOUNDED (1)				
155-23 Hunt	12-6 Use of Force 16-1 (3.06) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.07) Conduct towards the public 44-01 Arrests	The Cx alleges the SOs neglected their duty and used excessive force on him when they refused to write a citation or tow an illegally parked vehicle	Authorized dismiss as unfounded 4-0	There was insufficient information to prove or disprove the Cx's allegations.

		on his property and then arrested him.		
UNSUSTAINABLE (4)				
106-23 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 16-1 (3.19) Truthfulness 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty	The Cxs alleged that they contacted Zone 4 to file a complaint about the noise from her neighbor upstairs. SOs have responded but did not do anything about the noise.	Authorized dismiss as unsustainable 4-0	There is insufficient information or evidence to determine if the SOs violated PBP Policies or Procedures.
043-23 Hunt	12-6 Use of Force 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member/Employee 16-1 (3.7) Conduct toward the public	The Cx alleges that SO#1 and other unknown PBP Officers harassed him and used excessive force to remove him from Tequila Cowboy Bar without reason.	Authorized dismiss as unsustainable 4-0	There is insufficient information or evidence to determine if the SOs violated PBP Policies or Procedures.
029-23 Ellwood	16-0, (3.7.2) Conduct Toward the Public 40-19, (5.1.5) Mandatory Reports by Bureau Policy	The Cx alleges that the SO broke PBP policies by being rude to her and not taking a report when one was requested.	Authorized dismiss as unsustainable 4-0	There is insufficient information or evidence to determine if the SOs violated PBP Policies or Procedures.
CPRB CASE No. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	SUMMARY	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE
025-23 Ellwood	16-01.3.6 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.19 Truthfulness 40-19.3.4 Reports General	Cx alleges that the SO was not truthful in his charges against him. The Cx alleges that the SO made a false report against him to humiliate him due to the nature of the charges.	Authorized dismiss as unsustainable 4-0	There is insufficient information or evidence to determine if the SOs violated PBP Policies or Procedures.
OTHER (1)				
109-23 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 16-1 (3.19) Truthfulness	The Complainant (Cx) alleges the Subject Officer (SO) was rude and discourteous and used excessive force on W#1 after asking for identification because they were sitting in her	Dismissed as resolved. 4-0	The Cx has stopped cooperating. Two 10-day certified letters were issued, and both were returned to the sender. (investigator)

		vehicle listening to loud music.		
SUSPENDED (1)				
193-23 Edwards	12-6 Use of Force 16-01 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member	The Cx alleges she was falsely arrested for interference with custody of children, intimidation, retaliation, and obstruction related to a child abuse case in the neighborhood.	Authorized suspension until April 2024 4-0	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.

CONTINUED SUSPENSIONS (14) SUMMARIES PROVIDED UPON REQUEST OF MEMBERS			
CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	POSSIBLE CLOSING DATE
162-23 ED Ellwood	12-06 Use of Force 12-08 Matrix of Control 16-01.3.06 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.07 Conduct Toward the Public 44-01 Arrests	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
136-23 Ellwood	16-01.3.6 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.13 Neglect of Duty 41-03.3.3.6 Crash Response Reporting 69-03.8 Body Worn Camera and Digital Evidence Storage Systems	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
083-23 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public	More time is needed to speak with W#1 and obtain CAD and Duty Activity Log.	TBD

049-23 Ellwood	16-01.3.6 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.7 Conduct Toward the Public 16-01.3.19 Truthfulness 40-19.3.10.3 Correction of Reports 46-01.7.0 Interrogations 46-01.8.0 Administering Miranda 69-03.8.0 Body Worn Camera Recordings	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
025-23 Ellwood	16-01.3.6 Conduct Unbecoming 16-01.3.19 Truthfulness 40-19.3.4 Reports General	The Investigator is working to locate W#2 to conduct an interview.	TBD
010-23 Hunt	11-3 Unbiased Policing 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1(3.7) Conduct Towards the Public 16-1(3.13.1) Neglect of Duty 40-19 Reports 69-03 (8.1.2) Body Worn Camera	More time is needed to determine if the SO violated PBP policies and procedures when he neglected his duty to take a report for a traffic accident.	TBD
CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	POSSIBLE CLOSING DATE
181-22 Bridgett	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward The Public 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty PBP 41-03 Crash Response.	More time is needed to review BWC.	TBD
102-22 Ellwood	12-06 Use Of Force 16-1.3.06: Conduct Unbecoming 16-1.3.07: Conduct Toward The Public 16-1.3.13: Neglect of Duty	More time is needed to determine if the SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures when interacting with the Cx during two separate incidents.	TBD

099-22 Hunt	11.3 (3.0) Un-biased Policing 12-6 Use of Force 16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward The Public	More time is needed to determine if SOs violated PBP Policy and Procedures.	TBD
035-22 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming A Member 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward The Public 16-1 (3.9) Truthfulness 44-1 Arrests 45-2 (5.1) Warrantless Searches & Seizures	More time is needed to obtain BWC footage, SO statements, Affidavit of Probable Cause, receipts for vehicle repairs, and identify witnesses.	TBD
020-22 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member or Employee 16-1 (3.7) Conduct Toward the Public 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty 16-1 (3.19.1) Truthfulness 53-01, Court Appearances	The Cx, the victim of a home invasion, alleges that SO#1 was rude and discourteous towards her when she questioned why W#1 did not appear in court that day.	TBD
177-21 Hunt	16-1 (3.6) Conduct Unbecoming a Member 16-1 (3.13) Neglect of Duty 45-2 Warrantless Searches & Seizures 54-01 Traffic Citation	More time is needed to obtain BWC footage, SO statements, affidavits of probable cause, receipts for vehicle repairs, and identify the witnesses.	TBD
CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	REASON FOR CONTINUED INVESTIGATION	POSSIBLE CLOSING DATE
252-20 Ellwood	16-01 (3.7.1) Conduct Toward the 40-04 Public Motor Vehicle Stops	Waiting for SO statements.	TBD
87-18-ED Gamble	12-6 Use of Force 12-7 Discharge of firearms	Waiting for witnesses to cooperate.	TBD

	16-1 (3.6) Conduct unbecoming a member 16-1, (3.19) Truthfulness 62-1 Records/Reports/Files		
--	--	--	--